

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

Writing a Research Paper in Mathematics

Melina Freitag

Department of Mathematical Sciences
University of Bath

Postgraduate Away Day
13th May 2010

Sins of authors of mathematical papers

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

I do not claim that I am particularly good at or have a lot of
experience with writing papers!

Sins of authors of mathematical papers

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

I do not claim that I am particularly good at or have a lot of
experience with writing papers!

A personal review

Over the last 8 years I have perhaps read about 300 research papers;
less than maybe 30 of them were well-written.

Sins of authors of mathematical papers

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

I do not claim that I am particularly good at or have a lot of experience with writing papers!

A personal review

Over the last 8 years I have perhaps read about 300 research papers; less than maybe 30 of them were well-written.

There is a virtually inexhaustible supply of badly written papers.

Sins of authors of mathematical papers

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

- "Massively parallel computers (MPCs), characterized by their scalable architectures, are a viable platform on which to solve the so-called grand-challenge problems. These distributed-memory systems are expandable and can achieve a proportional performance increase without changing the basic architecture. In order to take full advantage of scalable hardware, the application software must also be scalable to exploit the increased computing capacity."

Get to the point!

Sins of authors of mathematical papers

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

- "Massively parallel computers (MPCs), characterized by their scalable architectures, are a viable platform on which to solve the so-called grand-challenge problems. These distributed-memory systems are expandable and can achieve a proportional performance increase without changing the basic architecture. In order to take full advantage of scalable hardware, the application software must also be scalable to exploit the increased computing capacity."

Get to the point!

- Many papers have no **key message**.

- "Massively parallel computers (MPCs), characterized by their scalable architectures, are a viable platform on which to solve the so-called grand-challenge problems. These distributed-memory systems are expandable and can achieve a proportional performance increase without changing the basic architecture. In order to take full advantage of scalable hardware, the application software must also be scalable to exploit the increased computing capacity."

Get to the point!

- Many papers have no **key message**.
- In many papers the sentences are too long. Use **short sentences**.

Sins of authors of mathematical papers

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

- "Massively parallel computers (MPCs), characterized by their scalable architectures, are a viable platform on which to solve the so-called grand-challenge problems. These distributed-memory systems are expandable and can achieve a proportional performance increase without changing the basic architecture. In order to take full advantage of scalable hardware, the application software must also be scalable to exploit the increased computing capacity."

Get to the point!

- Many papers have no **key message**.
- In many papers the sentences are too long. Use **short sentences**.
- Do **not plagiarise**.

- "Massively parallel computers (MPCs), characterized by their scalable architectures, are a viable platform on which to solve the so-called grand-challenge problems. These distributed-memory systems are expandable and can achieve a proportional performance increase without changing the basic architecture. In order to take full advantage of scalable hardware, the application software must also be scalable to exploit the increased computing capacity."

Get to the point!

- Many papers have no **key message**.
- In many papers the sentences are too long. Use **short sentences**.
- Do **not plagiarise**.
- Try **not to write the paper so only you know what you are talking about, and the reader does not have a clue!**

Outline

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

1 Before you write

2 Structure and Organisation

3 Presentation and writing process

4 The reviewing process

The Audience

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

Who are you writing this particular paper for?

The Audience

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

Who are you writing this particular paper for?

Everybody wants their paper to be read by someone.

The Audience

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

Who are you writing this particular paper for?

Everybody wants their paper to be read by someone.

Mathematical papers are read by specialists in a given domain.

The Audience

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

Who are you writing this particular paper for?

Everybody wants their paper to be read by someone.

Mathematical papers are read by specialists in a given domain.

Think of a **specific reader**

- Interest your reader.
- Leave out trivial results.

The Audience

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

Who are you writing this particular paper for?

■ Publish on your website?

The Audience

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

Who are you writing this particular paper for?

- Publish on your website?
- A journal paper?

The Audience

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

Who are you writing this particular paper for?

- Publish on your website?
- A journal paper?
- Conference proceedings?

The Audience

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

Who are you writing this particular paper for?

- Publish on your website?
- A journal paper?
- Conference proceedings?
- Thesis?

The Audience

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

Who are you writing this particular paper for?

- Publish on your website?
- A journal paper?
- Conference proceedings?
- Thesis?

Journal requirements

- Think about which journal you want to submit your article to (more theoretical? practical? ...).

The Audience

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

Who are you writing this particular paper for?

- Publish on your website?
- A journal paper?
- Conference proceedings?
- Thesis?

Journal requirements

- Think about which journal you want to submit your article to (more theoretical? practical? ...).
- Check journal requirements/regulations online (maximum paper length, pictures etc.).

The Audience

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

Who are you writing this particular paper for?

- Publish on your website?
- A journal paper?
- Conference proceedings?
- Thesis?

Journal requirements

- Think about which journal you want to submit your article to (more theoretical? practical? ...).
- Check journal requirements/regulations online (maximum paper length, pictures etc.).
- Most journals provide style files/templates.

Outline

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

1 Before you write

2 Structure and Organisation

3 Presentation and writing process

4 The reviewing process

First Draft

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

The first draft is the hardest part

- A paper should **tell a story**, if possible.

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

The first draft is the hardest part

- A paper should **tell a story**, if possible.
- If the organisation of the paper is good, the revision lies in the details.

First Draft

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

The first draft is the hardest part

- A paper should **tell a story**, if possible.
- If the organisation of the paper is good, the revision lies in the details.
- Editing and polishing.

First Draft

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

The first draft is the hardest part

- A paper should **tell a story**, if possible.
- If the organisation of the paper is good, the revision lies in the details.
- Editing and polishing.

An example outline

First Draft

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

The first draft is the hardest part

- A paper should **tell a story**, if possible.
- If the organisation of the paper is good, the revision lies in the details.
- Editing and polishing.

An example outline

- 1 Introduction (describe the problem clearly; put it into context).

First Draft

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

The first draft is the hardest part

- A paper should **tell a story**, if possible.
- If the organisation of the paper is good, the revision lies in the details.
- Editing and polishing.

An example outline

- 1 Introduction (describe the problem clearly; put it into context).
- 2 Section(s) on your main results/analysis (what is new/original in your paper?).

First Draft

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

The first draft is the hardest part

- A paper should **tell a story**, if possible.
- If the organisation of the paper is good, the revision lies in the details.
- Editing and polishing.

An example outline

- 1 Introduction (describe the problem clearly; put it into context).
- 2 Section(s) on your main results/analysis (what is new/original in your paper?).
- 3 Examples/Experiments/Numerical results/Computations/Comparisons and interpretations.

First Draft

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

The first draft is the hardest part

- A paper should **tell a story**, if possible.
- If the organisation of the paper is good, the revision lies in the details.
- Editing and polishing.

An example outline

- 1 Introduction (describe the problem clearly; put it into context).
- 2 Section(s) on your main results/analysis (what is new/original in your paper?).
- 3 Examples/Experiments/Numerical results/Computations/Comparisons and interpretations.
- 4 Conclusion/Open problems/Future work. (not necessary)

First Draft

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

An example outline.

- 1** Introduction.
- 2** Section(s) on your main results/analysis.
- 3** Examples/Experiments/Numerical results/Computations/Comparisons and interpretations.
- 4** Conclusion/Open problems/Future work. (not necessary)

First Draft

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

An example outline.

- 1** Introduction.
- 2** Section(s) on your main results/analysis.
- 3** Examples/Experiments/Numerical results/Computations/Comparisons and interpretations.
- 4** Conclusion/Open problems/Future work. (not necessary)

Fill the gaps

- What do you want to be in the sections?

First Draft

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

An example outline.

- 1** Introduction.
- 2** Section(s) on your main results/analysis.
- 3** Examples/Experiments/Numerical results/Computations/Comparisons and interpretations.
- 4** Conclusion/Open problems/Future work. (not necessary)

Fill the gaps

- What do you want to be in the sections?
- **Bullet point strategy.**

First Draft

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

An example outline.

- 1** Introduction.
- 2** Section(s) on your main results/analysis.
- 3** Examples/Experiments/Numerical results/Computations/Comparisons and interpretations.
- 4** Conclusion/Open problems/Future work. (not necessary)

Fill the gaps

- What do you want to be in the sections?
- **Bullet point strategy.**
- Add the main theorems and proofs/approaches/mathematical analysis/numerical examples (those are your main results).

First Draft

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

An example outline.

- 1** Introduction.
- 2** Section(s) on your main results/analysis.
- 3** Examples/Experiments/Numerical results/Computations/Comparisons and interpretations.
- 4** Conclusion/Open problems/Future work. (not necessary)

Fill the gaps

- What do you want to be in the sections?
- **Bullet point strategy.**
- Add the main theorems and proofs/approaches/mathematical analysis/numerical examples (those are your main results).

Now you have a "skeleton" to work with!

Writing process

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

From the first draft to a first paper version

- Form sentences from the bullet points.

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

From the first draft to a first paper version

- Form sentences from the bullet points.
- Fill in all the gaps.

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

From the first draft to a first paper version

- Form sentences from the bullet points.
- Fill in all the gaps.
- Write an abstract.

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

From the first draft to a first paper version

- Form sentences from the bullet points.
- Fill in all the gaps.
- Write an abstract.
- Add keywords.

More details

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

Title

- Should not be too long.
- Should not be too general.
- No abbreviations or complicated symbols.
- Verbal element (gerund or participle).

More details

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

Title

- Should not be too long.
- Should not be too general.
- No abbreviations or complicated symbols.
- Verbal element (gerund or participle).

Abstract

- Present the **main results** of the paper.
- Should be short and crisp.
- Avoid empty phrases like "In this article we prove, among other results, that ...". Just write "We prove that .."
- No complicated formulae.
- As independent from the article as possible.

Writing an abstract

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

Abstract MadLibs!®

This paper presents a _____ method for _____
(synonym for new) (sciencey verb)
the _____. Using _____, the
(noun few people have heard of) (something you didn't invent)
_____ was measured to be _____ +/- _____
(property) (number) (number)
_____. Results show _____ agreement with
(units) (sexy adjective)
theoretical predictions and significant improvement over
previous efforts by _____, et al. The work presented
(Loser)
here has profound implications for future studies of
_____ and may one day help solve the problem of
(buzzword)
_____.
(supreme sociological concern)

Keywords: _____, _____, _____
(buzzword) (buzzword) (buzzword)

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

Introduction

- 1 Abstract and introduction are your **main "selling points"**.
- 2 Interest your reader in the first paragraph!
- 3 States the problem, history of work and related problems/pointers to relevant work.
- 4 Your main results/theorems.

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

Introduction

- 1 Abstract and introduction are your **main "selling points"**.
- 2 Interest your reader in the first paragraph!
- 3 States the problem, history of work and related problems/pointers to relevant work.
- 4 Your main results/theorems.

Main Sections

- The body of the paper.
- Contains theorems/proofs/definitions/algorithms/numerical approaches.
- Choose section titles carefully!
- Not more than 5-7 sections, use subsections for better organisation.

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

Proofs

- The formulation of theorems and proofs is particularly important.
- Be precise.
- Especially, when proofing theorems think about your reader.
- Think about the "logic flow".

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

Proofs

- The formulation of theorems and proofs is particularly important.
- Be precise.
- Especially, when proofing theorems think about your reader.
- Think about the "logic flow".

References

- Add the references (most of them will be needed in the introduction).
- Use BIBTEX, MathSciNet, Google Scholar etc.
- Make sure your reference list is accurate and up-to-date.
- A narrow bibliography, particularly restricted to the author, is suspicious.
- A long bibliography is only really appropriate for survey papers.

Outline

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

1 Before you write

2 Structure and Organisation

3 Presentation and writing process

4 The reviewing process

Presentation and style

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

Make your paper clear and enjoyable to read!

Do not waffle!

You do not want the reader to get angry or bored.

Writing process

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

From the first version to a final version.

■ **This is an iterative process!**

Writing process

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

From the first version to a final version.

- **This is an iterative process!**
- Read your paper **several** times.

Writing process

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

From the first version to a final version.

- **This is an iterative process!**
- Read your paper **several** times.
- Pay particular attention to
 - structure

From the first version to a final version.

- **This is an iterative process!**
- Read your paper **several** times.
- Pay particular attention to
 - structure
 - main idea/result should be in the introduction

From the first version to a final version.

- **This is an iterative process!**
- Read your paper **several** times.
- Pay particular attention to
 - structure
 - main idea/result should be in the introduction
 - logical flow (no detective novels!)

From the first version to a final version.

- **This is an iterative process!**
- Read your paper **several** times.
- Pay particular attention to
 - structure
 - main idea/result should be in the introduction
 - logical flow (no detective novels!)
 - theorems and proofs (where is the author going?)

From the first version to a final version.

- **This is an iterative process!**
- Read your paper **several** times.
- Pay particular attention to
 - structure
 - main idea/result should be in the introduction
 - logical flow (no detective novels!)
 - theorems and proofs (where is the author going?)
 - spelling/grammar

From the first version to a final version.

- **This is an iterative process!**
- Read your paper **several** times.
- Pay particular attention to
 - structure
 - main idea/result should be in the introduction
 - logical flow (no detective novels!)
 - theorems and proofs (where is the author going?)
 - spelling/grammar
 - label for equations/figures/Theorems etc. (\LaTeX).

Outline

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

1 Before you write

2 Structure and Organisation

3 Presentation and writing process

4 The reviewing process

Procedure

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

- 1 Submit the paper (online or by sending an email to the editor/associate editor).

Procedure

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

- 1** Submit the paper (online or by sending an email to the editor/associate editor).
- 2** After some time (1 - 6 months) you will receive 2-3 referee reports.
 - Paper gets accepted.
 - Paper gets accepted with minor revisions.
 - Paper gets major revisions.
 - Paper gets rejected.

Procedure

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

- 1** Submit the paper (online or by sending an email to the editor/associate editor).
- 2** After some time (1 - 6 months) you will receive 2-3 referee reports.
 - Paper gets accepted.
 - Paper gets accepted with minor revisions.
 - Paper gets major revisions.
 - Paper gets rejected.
- 3** Do corrections and resubmit the paper. Go to 1.

Procedure

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

- 1** Submit the paper (online or by sending an email to the editor/associate editor).
- 2** After some time (1 - 6 months) you will receive 2-3 referee reports.
 - Paper gets accepted.
 - Paper gets accepted with minor revisions.
 - Paper gets major revisions.
 - Paper gets rejected.
- 3** Do corrections and resubmit the paper. Go to 1.
- 4** Once the paper gets accepted, it will be dealt with by the publisher.

Procedure

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

- 1** Submit the paper (online or by sending an email to the editor/associate editor).
- 2** After some time (1 - 6 months) you will receive 2-3 referee reports.
 - Paper gets accepted.
 - Paper gets accepted with minor revisions.
 - Paper gets major revisions.
 - Paper gets rejected.
- 3** Do corrections and resubmit the paper. Go to 1.
- 4** Once the paper gets accepted, it will be dealt with by the publisher.
- 5** You will receive page proofs by the publisher, carefully read them again!

Procedure

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

- 1** Submit the paper (online or by sending an email to the editor/associate editor).
- 2** After some time (1 - 6 months) you will receive 2-3 referee reports.
 - Paper gets accepted.
 - Paper gets accepted with minor revisions.
 - Paper gets major revisions.
 - Paper gets rejected.
- 3** Do corrections and resubmit the paper. Go to 1.
- 4** Once the paper gets accepted, it will be dealt with by the publisher.
- 5** You will receive page proofs by the publisher, carefully read them again!
- 6** It will be printed (often appear online earlier)

Procedure

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process

- 1** Submit the paper (online or by sending an email to the editor/associate editor).
- 2** After some time (1 - 6 months) you will receive 2-3 referee reports.
 - Paper gets accepted.
 - Paper gets accepted with minor revisions.
 - Paper gets major revisions.
 - Paper gets rejected.
- 3** Do corrections and resubmit the paper. Go to 1.
- 4** Once the paper gets accepted, it will be dealt with by the publisher.
- 5** You will receive page proofs by the publisher, carefully read them again!
- 6** It will be printed (often appear online earlier)
- 7** The whole process usually takes about a year, but often longer.

ADDRESSING REVIEWER COMMENTS

BAD REVIEWS ON YOUR PAPER? FOLLOW THESE GUIDELINES AND YOU MAY YET GET IT PAST THE EDITOR.

Reviewer comment:

"The method/device/paradigm the authors propose is clearly wrong."

How NOT to respond:

✗ "Yes, we know. We thought we could still get a paper out of it. Sorry."

Correct response:

✓ "The reviewer raises an interesting concern. However, as the focus of this work is exploratory and not performance-based, validation was not found to be of critical importance to the contribution of the paper."

Reviewer comment:

"The authors fail to reference the work of Smith et al., who solved the same problem 20 years ago."

How NOT to respond:

✗ "Huh. We didn't think anybody had read that. Actually, their solution is better than ours."

Correct response:

✓ "The reviewer raises an interesting concern. However, our work is based on completely different first principles (we use different variable names), and has a much more attractive graphical user interface."

Reviewer comment:

"This paper is poorly written and scientifically unsound. I do not recommend it for publication."

How NOT to respond:

✗ "You #&@% reviewer! I know who you are! I'm gonna get you when it's my turn to review!"

Correct response:

✓ "The reviewer raises an interesting concern. However, we feel the reviewer did not fully comprehend the scope of the work, and misjudged the results based on incorrect assumptions."

www.phdcomics.com

Writing your
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and
Organisation

Presentation and
writing process

The reviewing
process



N. J. HIGHAM, *Handbook of writing for the mathematical sciences*, Society for Industrial Mathematics, 1998.