

# Writing a Research Paper in Mathematics

Melina Freitag

Department of Mathematical Sciences  
University of Bath

Postgraduate Away Day  
13th May 2010

I do not claim that I am particularly good at or have a lot of  
experience with writing papers!

# Sins of authors of mathematical papers

Writing your  
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and  
Organisation

Presentation and  
writing process

The reviewing  
process

I do not claim that I am particularly good at or have a lot of  
experience with writing papers!

## A personal review

Over the last 8 years I have perhaps read about 300 research papers;  
less than maybe 30 of them were well-written.

# Sins of authors of mathematical papers

Writing your  
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and  
Organisation

Presentation and  
writing process

The reviewing  
process

I do not claim that I am particularly good at or have a lot of experience with writing papers!

## A personal review

Over the last 8 years I have perhaps read about 300 research papers; less than maybe 30 of them were well-written.

There is a virtually inexhaustible supply of badly written papers.

# Sins of authors of mathematical papers

Writing your  
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and  
Organisation

Presentation and  
writing process

The reviewing  
process

- "Massively parallel computers (MPCs), characterized by their scalable architectures, are a viable platform on which to solve the so-called grand-challenge problems. These distributed-memory systems are expandable and can achieve a proportional performance increase without changing the basic architecture. In order to take full advantage of scalable hardware, the application software must also be scalable to exploit the increased computing capacity."

**Get to the point!**

# Sins of authors of mathematical papers

Writing your  
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and  
Organisation

Presentation and  
writing process

The reviewing  
process

- "Massively parallel computers (MPCs), characterized by their scalable architectures, are a viable platform on which to solve the so-called grand-challenge problems. These distributed-memory systems are expandable and can achieve a proportional performance increase without changing the basic architecture. In order to take full advantage of scalable hardware, the application software must also be scalable to exploit the increased computing capacity."

**Get to the point!**

- Many papers have no **key message**.

- "Massively parallel computers (MPCs), characterized by their scalable architectures, are a viable platform on which to solve the so-called grand-challenge problems. These distributed-memory systems are expandable and can achieve a proportional performance increase without changing the basic architecture. In order to take full advantage of scalable hardware, the application software must also be scalable to exploit the increased computing capacity."

**Get to the point!**

- Many papers have no **key message**.
- In many papers the sentences are too long. Use **short sentences**.

# Sins of authors of mathematical papers

Writing your  
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and  
Organisation

Presentation and  
writing process

The reviewing  
process

- "Massively parallel computers (MPCs), characterized by their scalable architectures, are a viable platform on which to solve the so-called grand-challenge problems. These distributed-memory systems are expandable and can achieve a proportional performance increase without changing the basic architecture. In order to take full advantage of scalable hardware, the application software must also be scalable to exploit the increased computing capacity."

**Get to the point!**

- Many papers have no **key message**.
- In many papers the sentences are too long. Use **short sentences**.
- Do **not plagiarise**.

# Sins of authors of mathematical papers

Writing your  
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and  
Organisation

Presentation and  
writing process

The reviewing  
process

- "Massively parallel computers (MPCs), characterized by their scalable architectures, are a viable platform on which to solve the so-called grand-challenge problems. These distributed-memory systems are expandable and can achieve a proportional performance increase without changing the basic architecture. In order to take full advantage of scalable hardware, the application software must also be scalable to exploit the increased computing capacity."

**Get to the point!**

- Many papers have no **key message**.
- In many papers the sentences are too long. Use **short sentences**.
- Do **not plagiarise**.
- Try **not to write the paper so only you know what you are talking about, and the reader does not have a clue!**

Writing your  
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and  
Organisation

Presentation and  
writing process

The reviewing  
process

**1** Before you write

**2** Structure and Organisation

**3** Presentation and writing process

**4** The reviewing process

## Writing your thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and  
Organisation

Presentation and  
writing process

The reviewing  
process

## Who are you writing this particular paper for?

## Who are you writing this particular paper for?

Everybody wants their paper to be read by someone.

## Who are you writing this particular paper for?

Everybody wants their paper to be read by someone.

Mathematical papers are read by specialists in a given domain.

## Who are you writing this particular paper for?

Everybody wants their paper to be read by someone.

Mathematical papers are read by specialists in a given domain.

Think of a **specific reader**

- Interest your reader.
- Leave out trivial results.

## Who are you writing this particular paper for?

- Publish on your website?

## Who are you writing this particular paper for?

- Publish on your website?
- A journal paper?

## Who are you writing this particular paper for?

- Publish on your website?
- **A journal paper?**
- Conference proceedings?

## Who are you writing this particular paper for?

- Publish on your website?
- **A journal paper?**
- Conference proceedings?
- Thesis?

## Who are you writing this particular paper for?

- Publish on your website?
- **A journal paper?**
- Conference proceedings?
- Thesis?

## Journal requirements

- Think about which journal you want to submit your article to (more theoretical? practical? ...).

## Who are you writing this particular paper for?

- Publish on your website?
- **A journal paper?**
- Conference proceedings?
- Thesis?

## Journal requirements

- Think about which journal you want to submit your article to (more theoretical? practical? ...).
- Check journal requirements/regulations online (maximum paper length, pictures etc.).

## Who are you writing this particular paper for?

- Publish on your website?
- **A journal paper?**
- Conference proceedings?
- Thesis?

## Journal requirements

- Think about which journal you want to submit your article to (more theoretical? practical? ...).
- Check journal requirements/regulations online (maximum paper length, pictures etc.).
- Most journals provide style files/templates.

Writing your  
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and  
Organisation

Presentation and  
writing process

The reviewing  
process

1 Before you write

2 Structure and Organisation

3 Presentation and writing process

4 The reviewing process

## The first draft is the hardest part

- A paper should **tell a story**, if possible.

## The first draft is the hardest part

- A paper should **tell a story**, if possible.
- If the organisation of the paper is good, the revision lies in the details.

## The first draft is the hardest part

- A paper should **tell a story**, if possible.
- If the organisation of the paper is good, the revision lies in the details.
- Editing and polishing.

## The first draft is the hardest part

- A paper should **tell a story**, if possible.
- If the organisation of the paper is good, the revision lies in the details.
- Editing and polishing.

## An example outline

## The first draft is the hardest part

- A paper should **tell a story**, if possible.
- If the organisation of the paper is good, the revision lies in the details.
- Editing and polishing.

## An example outline

- 1 Introduction (describe the problem clearly; put it into context).

## The first draft is the hardest part

- A paper should **tell a story**, if possible.
- If the organisation of the paper is good, the revision lies in the details.
- Editing and polishing.

## An example outline

- 1 Introduction (describe the problem clearly; put it into context).
- 2 Section(s) on your main results/analysis (what is new/original in your paper?).

## The first draft is the hardest part

- A paper should **tell a story**, if possible.
- If the organisation of the paper is good, the revision lies in the details.
- Editing and polishing.

## An example outline

- 1 Introduction (describe the problem clearly; put it into context).
- 2 Section(s) on your main results/analysis (what is new/original in your paper?).
- 3 Examples/Experiments/Numerical results/Computations/Comparisons and interpretations.

## The first draft is the hardest part

- A paper should **tell a story**, if possible.
- If the organisation of the paper is good, the revision lies in the details.
- Editing and polishing.

## An example outline

- 1 Introduction (describe the problem clearly; put it into context).
- 2 Section(s) on your main results/analysis (what is new/original in your paper?).
- 3 Examples/Experiments/Numerical results/Computations/Comparisons and interpretations.
- 4 Conclusion/Open problems/Future work. (not necessary)

## An example outline.

- 1 Introduction.
- 2 Section(s) on your main results/analysis.
- 3 Examples/Experiments/Numerical results/Computations/Comparisons and interpretations.
- 4 Conclusion/Open problems/Future work. (not necessary)

## An example outline.

- 1 Introduction.
- 2 Section(s) on your main results/analysis.
- 3 Examples/Experiments/Numerical results/Computations/Comparisons and interpretations.
- 4 Conclusion/Open problems/Future work. (not necessary)

## Fill the gaps

- What do you want to be in the sections?

## An example outline.

- 1** Introduction.
- 2** Section(s) on your main results/analysis.
- 3** Examples/Experiments/Numerical results/Computations/Comparisons and interpretations.
- 4** Conclusion/Open problems/Future work. (not necessary)

## Fill the gaps

- What do you want to be in the sections?
- **Bullet point strategy.**

## An example outline.

- 1 Introduction.
- 2 Section(s) on your main results/analysis.
- 3 Examples/Experiments/Numerical results/Computations/Comparisons and interpretations.
- 4 Conclusion/Open problems/Future work. (not necessary)

## Fill the gaps

- What do you want to be in the sections?
- **Bullet point strategy.**
- Add the main theorems and proofs/approaches/mathematical analysis/numerical examples (those are your main results).

## An example outline.

- 1 Introduction.
- 2 Section(s) on your main results/analysis.
- 3 Examples/Experiments/Numerical results/Computations/Comparisons and interpretations.
- 4 Conclusion/Open problems/Future work. (not necessary)

## Fill the gaps

- What do you want to be in the sections?
- **Bullet point strategy.**
- Add the main theorems and proofs/approaches/mathematical analysis/numerical examples (those are your main results).

**Now you have a "skeleton" to work with!**

Writing your  
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and  
Organisation

Presentation and  
writing process

The reviewing  
process

## From the first draft to a first paper version

- Form sentences from the bullet points.

Writing your  
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and  
Organisation

Presentation and  
writing process

The reviewing  
process

## From the first draft to a first paper version

- Form sentences from the bullet points.
- Fill in all the gaps.

Writing your  
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and  
Organisation

Presentation and  
writing process

The reviewing  
process

## From the first draft to a first paper version

- Form sentences from the bullet points.
- Fill in all the gaps.
- Write an abstract.

Writing your  
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and  
Organisation

Presentation and  
writing process

The reviewing  
process

## From the first draft to a first paper version

- Form sentences from the bullet points.
- Fill in all the gaps.
- Write an abstract.
- Add keywords.

## Title

- Should not be too long.
- Should not be too general.
- No abbreviations or complicated symbols.
- Verbal element (gerund or participle).

## Title

- Should not be too long.
- Should not be too general.
- No abbreviations or complicated symbols.
- Verbal element (gerund or participle).

## Abstract

- Present the **main results** of the paper.
- Should be short and crisp.
- Avoid empty phrases like "In this article we prove, among other results, that ...". Just write "We prove that .."
- No complicated formulae.
- As independent from the article as possible.

## Abstract MadLibs!!

This paper presents a \_\_\_\_\_ method for \_\_\_\_\_  
(synonym for new) (sciencey verb)  
the \_\_\_\_\_. Using \_\_\_\_\_, the  
(noun few people have heard of) (something you didn't invent)  
\_\_\_\_\_ was measured to be \_\_\_\_\_ +/- \_\_\_\_\_  
(property) (number) (number)  
\_\_\_\_\_. Results show \_\_\_\_\_ agreement with  
(units) (sexy adjective)  
theoretical predictions and significant improvement over  
previous efforts by \_\_\_\_\_, et al. The work presented  
(Loser)  
here has profound implications for future studies of  
\_\_\_\_\_ and may one day help solve the problem of  
(buzzword)  
\_\_\_\_\_.  
(supreme sociological concern)

**Keywords:** \_\_\_\_\_  
(buzzword) (buzzword) (buzzword)

## Introduction

- 1 Abstract and introduction are your **main "selling points"**.
- 2 **Interest your reader in the first paragraph!**
- 3 States the problem, history of work and related problems/pointers to relevant work.
- 4 Your main results/theorems.

## Introduction

- 1 Abstract and introduction are your **main "selling points"**.
- 2 **Interest your reader in the first paragraph!**
- 3 States the problem, history of work and related problems/pointers to relevant work.
- 4 Your main results/theorems.

## Main Sections

- The body of the paper.
- Contains theorems/proofs/definitions/algorithms/numerical approaches.
- Choose section titles carefully!
- Not more than 5-7 sections, use subsections for better organisation.

## Proofs

- The formulation of theorems and proofs is particularly important.
- Be precise.
- Especially, when proofing theorems think about your reader.
- Think about the "logic flow".

## Proofs

- The formulation of theorems and proofs is particularly important.
- Be precise.
- Especially, when proofing theorems think about your reader.
- Think about the "logic flow".

## References

- Add the references (most of them will be needed in the introduction).
- Use  $\text{BIBTeX}$ , MathSciNet, Google Scholar etc.
- Make sure your reference list is accurate and up-to-date.
- A narrow bibliography, particularly restricted to the author, is suspicious.
- A long bibliography is only really appropriate for survey papers.

Writing your  
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and  
Organisation

Presentation and  
writing process

The reviewing  
process

1 Before you write

2 Structure and Organisation

**3 Presentation and writing process**

4 The reviewing process

Make your paper clear and enjoyable to read!

**Do not waffle!**

You do not want the reader to get angry or bored.

## Writing your thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and  
Organisation

Presentation and  
writing process

The reviewing  
process

From the first version to a final version.

■ **This is an iterative process!**

From the first version to a final version.

- **This is an iterative process!**
- Read your paper **several** times.

From the first version to a final version.

- **This is an iterative process!**
- Read your paper **several** times.
- Pay particular attention to
  - structure

From the first version to a final version.

- **This is an iterative process!**
- Read your paper **several** times.
- Pay particular attention to
  - structure
  - main idea/result should be in the introduction

From the first version to a final version.

- **This is an iterative process!**
- Read your paper **several** times.
- Pay particular attention to
  - structure
  - main idea/result should be in the introduction
  - logical flow (no detective novels!)

From the first version to a final version.

- **This is an iterative process!**
- Read your paper **several** times.
- Pay particular attention to
  - structure
  - main idea/result should be in the introduction
  - logical flow (no detective novels!)
  - theorems and proofs (where is the author going?)

From the first version to a final version.

- **This is an iterative process!**
- Read your paper **several** times.
- Pay particular attention to
  - structure
  - main idea/result should be in the introduction
  - logical flow (no detective novels!)
  - theorems and proofs (where is the author going?)
  - spelling/grammar

From the first version to a final version.

- **This is an iterative process!**
- Read your paper **several** times.
- Pay particular attention to
  - structure
  - main idea/result should be in the introduction
  - logical flow (no detective novels!)
  - theorems and proofs (where is the author going?)
  - spelling/grammar
  - label for equations/figures/Theorems etc. ( $\text{\LaTeX}$ ).

Writing your  
thesis

Melina Freitag

Outline

Before you write

Structure and  
Organisation

Presentation and  
writing process

The reviewing  
process

- 1 Before you write
- 2 Structure and Organisation
- 3 Presentation and writing process
- 4 The reviewing process**

- 1** Submit the paper (online or by sending an email to the editor/associate editor).

- 1** Submit the paper (online or by sending an email to the editor/associate editor).
- 2** After some time (1 - 6 months) you will receive 2-3 referee reports.
  - Paper gets accepted.
  - Paper gets accepted with minor revisions.
  - Paper gets major revisions.
  - Paper gets rejected.

- 1** Submit the paper (online or by sending an email to the editor/associate editor).
- 2** After some time (1 - 6 months) you will receive 2-3 referee reports.
  - Paper gets accepted.
  - Paper gets accepted with minor revisions.
  - Paper gets major revisions.
  - Paper gets rejected.
- 3** Do corrections and resubmit the paper. Go to 1.

- 1** Submit the paper (online or by sending an email to the editor/associate editor).
- 2** After some time (1 - 6 months) you will receive 2-3 referee reports.
  - Paper gets accepted.
  - Paper gets accepted with minor revisions.
  - Paper gets major revisions.
  - Paper gets rejected.
- 3** Do corrections and resubmit the paper. Go to 1.
- 4** Once the paper gets accepted, it will be dealt with by the publisher.

- 1** Submit the paper (online or by sending an email to the editor/associate editor).
- 2** After some time (1 - 6 months) you will receive 2-3 referee reports.
  - Paper gets accepted.
  - Paper gets accepted with minor revisions.
  - Paper gets major revisions.
  - Paper gets rejected.
- 3** Do corrections and resubmit the paper. Go to 1.
- 4** Once the paper gets accepted, it will be dealt with by the publisher.
- 5** You will receive page proofs by the publisher, carefully read them again!

- 1** Submit the paper (online or by sending an email to the editor/associate editor).
- 2** After some time (1 - 6 months) you will receive 2-3 referee reports.
  - Paper gets accepted.
  - Paper gets accepted with minor revisions.
  - Paper gets major revisions.
  - Paper gets rejected.
- 3** Do corrections and resubmit the paper. Go to 1.
- 4** Once the paper gets accepted, it will be dealt with by the publisher.
- 5** You will receive page proofs by the publisher, carefully read them again!
- 6** It will be printed (often appear online earlier)

- 1 Submit the paper (online or by sending an email to the editor/associate editor).
- 2 After some time (1 - 6 months) you will receive 2-3 referee reports.
  - Paper gets accepted.
  - Paper gets accepted with minor revisions.
  - Paper gets major revisions.
  - Paper gets rejected.
- 3 Do corrections and resubmit the paper. Go to 1.
- 4 Once the paper gets accepted, it will be dealt with by the publisher.
- 5 You will receive page proofs by the publisher, carefully read them again!
- 6 It will be printed (often appear online earlier)
- 7 The whole process usually takes about a year, but often longer.

## ADDRESSING REVIEWER COMMENTS

BAD REVIEWS ON YOUR PAPER? FOLLOW THESE GUIDELINES AND YOU MAY YET GET IT PAST THE EDITOR:

### Reviewer comment:

"The method/device/paradigm the authors propose is clearly wrong."

### How NOT to respond:

✗ "Yes, we know. We thought we could still get a paper out of it. Sorry."

### Correct response:

✓ "The reviewer raises an interesting concern. However, as the focus of this work is exploratory and not performance-based, validation was not found to be of critical importance to the contribution of the paper."

### Reviewer comment:

"The authors fail to reference the work of Smith et al., who solved the same problem 20 years ago."

### How NOT to respond:

✗ "Huh. We didn't think anybody had read that. Actually, their solution is better than ours."

### Correct response:

✓ "The reviewer raises an interesting concern. However, our work is based on completely different first principles (we use different variable names), and has a much more attractive graphical user interface."

### Reviewer comment:

"This paper is poorly written and scientifically unsound. I do not recommend it for publication."

### How NOT to respond:

✗ "You #@%\* reviewer! I know who you are! I'm gonna get you when it's my turn to review!"

### Correct response:

✓ "The reviewer raises an interesting concern. However, we feel the reviewer did not fully comprehend the scope of the work, and misjudged the results based on incorrect assumptions."

[www.phdcomics.com](http://www.phdcomics.com)



N. J. HIGHAM, *Handbook of writing for the mathematical sciences*, Society for Industrial Mathematics, 1998.